

Item 6:

**Request to Approve September 30, 2022 Board Meeting
Minutes**

ACTION

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the September 30, 2022 Board meeting minutes.

STATE BOARD FOR EDUCATOR CERTIFICATION
MEETING AGENDA
SEPTEMBER 30, 2022 AT 8:30 AM
1701 N. CONGRESS AVE. ROOM 1-104

The Board will meet in open session and after determining the presence of a quorum, deliberate and possibly take formal action, including emergency action, on any of the following agenda items:

Moment of Silence

Pledge of Allegiance

1. Call to Order

The State Board for Educator Certification (SBEC) convened its meeting at 8:33 AM on Friday, September 30, 2022.

Present: Dr. Robert Brescia, Dr. Veronica Galvan, Ms. Bena Glasscock, Mr. Rex Gore, Ms. Courtney MacDonald, Dr. Scott Muri, Mr. Andrew Kim, Dr. Andrew Lofters, Ms. Kelvey Oeser, Dr. Alma Rodriguez, Ms. Jean Streepey, Mr. Tommy Coleman, and Mr. Josue Tamarez Torres.

Absent: Ms. Julia Dvorak and Ms. Cristina Galindo.

2. Associate Commissioner's Comments Regarding the SBEC Agenda

Emily Garcia expressed gratitude to the Board and external stakeholders who engaged in the previous day's work session and shared remarks related to feedback from the board concerning ongoing EPCE division updates that will be periodically incorporated into future SBEC meetings.

3. Public Comment

Public Testimony:

Ms. Wendy Burk – Self

Mr. Joe Burk – Self

Ms. Christine Broughal – Texans for SPED Reform

Ms. Amy Bachtel – Texas School for the Deaf

CONSENT AGENDA

Ms. Pogue presented this item to the Board. She explained the purpose and logistics of the consent agenda. The consent agenda took up agenda items 4-7 with no discussion. Mr. Coleman pulled item 8 for separate discussion and vote.

4. ***Request to Approve July 21, 2022 Work Session Minutes***
5. ***Request to Approve July 22, 2022 Board Meeting Minutes***
6. ***Proposed Rule Review of 19 TAC Chapter 233, Categories of Classroom Teaching Certificates***
7. ***Adoption of Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 241, Certification as Principal***
8. ***Adoption of Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs***

Dr. Olofson presented this item to the Board. Mr. Coleman asked about educator preparation program (EPP) accountability in the Accountability System for Educator Preparation related to a pilot exam, Dr. Olofson clarified that SBEC rule provides for EPPs to not be held accountable for any exam that is designated as a pilot and that the ASEP index provides a method for including all data available for an EPP while allowing for missing data on indicators or demographic groups.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Kim to approve consent agenda items 4 - 7. Second was made by Ms. Glasscock, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion was made by Mr. Kim to approve consent agenda item 8. Second was made by Dr. Brescia, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

DISCUSSION AND ACTION

9. ***Consideration of Petitions for Adoption of Rule Change Concerning 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification, Subchapter B, General Certification Requirements, §230.11, General Requirements***

Ms. Cook presented this item to the Board. She provided a quick overview of Texas Government Code 2001.021 and SBEC rules in Chapter 250 that provide guidance on an individual's process to submit a petition that offers feedback on suggested ways to improve current SBEC rulemaking. Ms. Cook explained that the Board has two choices with the petition process: either to deny the petition or to direct TEA staff to engage in rulemaking around the feedback provided in the petition. Ms. Cook shared that the two petitions submitted in September focused on the current requirements around demonstration of English language proficiency. Ms. Cook highlighted the three ways currently supported in rule to demonstrate English language proficiency: completion of an undergraduate or graduate degree in the U.S; TOEFL iBT scores; completion of an undergraduate or graduate degree from one of the countries adopted into SBEC rule. Ms. Cook walked the Board through the two petitions. Petition 1 included a request to adopt a minimum score of 20 for the speaking, listening, reading, and writing sections of the TOEFL iBT. Ms. Cook shared timelines of events that started in 2016 when a petition was submitted around use of the Speaking component of the TOEFL to demonstrate English language proficiency. Ms. Cook

briefly shared that prior to use of the TOEFL, the Board used the Test of Spoken English as a demonstration of English language proficiency. Ms. Cook explained the work that went into rulemaking to get us where we are today. She emphasized the important work done by stakeholders. Petition 2 included a request to add Uganda to the list of countries adopted by the SBEC to demonstrate English language proficiency. Ms. Cook expressed respect for the petitioner's request and highlighted the work that has been done to date around the list of countries adopted into SBEC rule. Ms. Cook mentioned the last round of rulemaking earlier this year that expanded the list of countries to a total of 32. Ms. Cook explained that she recommends denying the petition at this time, not as a permanent closure to rulemaking. Ms. Cook thanked the Board for their ongoing support, thoughtful deliberation, and ongoing questions to staff to ensure that rulemaking is robust, equitable, and thought out. Several board members asked questions about both petitions as relates to required scores on the TOEFL and the list of countries adopted into SBEC rule. Ms. Cook responded to questions, thanked the Board for their thoughtfulness and feedback, and agreed that TEA staff have an opportunity to do continued research around both issues raised by the petitioners. There were no additional questions from the Board and following the vote, Ms. Streepey thanked Ms. Cook for the presentation.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Kim to deny the petitions concerning the English language proficiency requirement in 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification, Subchapter B, General Certification Requirements, §230.11, General Requirements, because the State Board for Educator Certification has adopted the minimum scale scores on each of the sections included in the TOEFL iBT based on standards advisory committee recommendations and because Uganda does not appear on either of the university systems' approved list of countries, at this time. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

10. Approval of Proposed 2023 State Board for Educator Certification Meeting Dates

Ms. Pogue presented this item to the Board. Ms. Pogue explained the proposed SBEC meeting dates for 2023 comply with the statutory requirements that the SBOE have 90 days to review all SBEC proposed rules and the 180 days to take action once the Board proposes a rule. Ms. Pogue pointed out the dates were approved by SBEC Chair, Ms. Streepey, and do not conflict with the state's testing calendar. After Board discussion regarding the possible need to expand the one-day meetings to being a day-and-a half meeting starting after the legislative session, the Board approved the 2023 meeting dates of: February 10, 2023, April 28, 2023, July 20, 2023 Work Session, July 21, 2023, September 28 – 29, 2023, and December 8 – 9, 2023. Staff will notify the Board if there isn't a need for the day-and-a half meetings no later than a month prior to the set meeting dates.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. MacDonald to approve the SBEC 2023 Board meeting and work session dates as presented. Second was made by Mr. Tamarez Torres, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

DISCIPLINARY CASES

11. Pending or Contemplated Litigation, including Disciplinary Cases

A. Defaults

No Answer Defaults

1. In the Matter of Jasmine Monet Adams; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
2. In the Matter of John S. Almasi; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
3. In the Matter of Anam Iqbal Bhamani; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
4. In the Matter of Miranda Pearl Chachere; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
5. In the Matter of Bryanna D. Charles; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
6. In the Matter of Ovidio Cesar Gonzalez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
7. In the Matter of Bianca Mercedes Hall; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

8. In the Matter of LaChelle James; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
9. In the Matter of Blake Price; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
10. In the Matter of Quanethia Rhodes; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
11. In the Matter of Gabriel Gray Santillan; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
12. In the Matter of Amanda Schroeder; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
13. In the Matter of Jessica Vaquero; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
14. In the Matter of Ora-Anna Brown; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
15. In the Matter of Alexandra DeHaven; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
16. In the Matter of Jennifer Nicole King; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

- 17. In the Matter of Marissa Shae Mix; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 18. In the Matter of Amy D. Sammons; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 19. In the Matter of Kimberly Anne Kane; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 20. In the Matter of Seth McCool; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 21. In the Matter of Kendrick B. Payne; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 22. In the Matter of Devin C. Ruby; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 23. In the Matter of Rose Ann Verstynen; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 24. In the Matter of Cesar De La Portilla; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 25. In the Matter of Tyler D. de Salazar; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

- 26. In the Matter of Danielle Hudson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 27. In the Matter of Cecilia Noel; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 28. In the Matter of Adam Kraig Reeves; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 29. In the Matter of Olivia R. Telebelsarfi; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 30. In the Matter of Deyavor Roshell Harnage; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 31. In the Matter of Elsa Ramirez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 32. In the Matter of James D. Sartor; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 33. In the Matter of Rebecca Barrientos; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 34. In the Matter of Michael Chase Borger; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

35. In the Matter of Layla Michelle Englade; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
36. In the Matter of Carolyn Sue Fogel; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
37. In the Matter of Cleveland S. Harris Jr.; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
38. In the Matter of Todd M. Hemingway; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
39. In the Matter of Erica M. Jones-Johnson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
40. In the Matter of Jessika L. Patten; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
41. In the Matter of Sydney Peltier; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
42. In the Matter of Jennifer K. Qualia; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
43. In the Matter of Silvina Salazar; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

44. In the Matter of Jayla Janae Sanders; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
45. In the Matter of Brandi Stephens Nobles; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
46. In the Matter of Jacob Vasquez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
47. In the Matter of Gene Bills III; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
48. In the Matter of Claire Burke; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
49. In the Matter of Mallory Sydney Daigle; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
50. In the Matter of Jason Darnell; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
51. In the Matter of Kyteja Davidson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
52. In the Matter of Danielle Isles; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

53. In the Matter of Dylan Lambert; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
54. In the Matter of Christian Ortiz; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
55. In the Matter of Kristen Rillieux; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
56. In the Matter of Clarence Texada III; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
57. In the Matter of Kristin N. Tillotson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
58. In the Matter of Januerri Torres; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
59. In the Matter of Victoria Walker; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
60. In the Matter of Jake Michael Shanley; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Suspension until expiration of certificate on January 22, 2023
61. In the Matter of Amanda Nicole Cheatham; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 11-month suspension

62. In the Matter of Elizabeth Umanzor; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 11-month suspension
63. In the Matter of Lana M. Garcia; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 11-month suspension
64. In the Matter of Michael David Kawazoe; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 11-month suspension
65. In the Matter of Veasna Chhim; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension
66. In the Matter of Amy Dian Bedinger; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
67. In the Matter of Randy Arick Haddox Jr.; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
68. In the Matter of Lisa R. Patton; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
69. In the Matter of Douglas Othmar Schwarzenberger; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

- 70. In the Matter of Zachary Cundiff; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

- 71. In the Matter of Stephanie Victoria Luke; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

- 72. In the Matter of Damian D. Davis; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

- 73. In the Matter of Jeffra G. Gutierrez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Gore that the Board grant staff's request for the issuance of default judgments on cases 1 – 65 and 67-73, and issue final orders consistent with staff's recommendations. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board grant staff's request for the issuance of default judgment on case 66 and issue a final order consistent with staff's recommendation. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

SOAH Defaults

- 1. In the Matter of Fabriel Cisneros; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation

- 2. In the Matter of Toni Davis; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation

3. In the Matter of Fredrick Adarryl Chambers; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Inscribed Reprimand

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board grant staff's request for the issuance of SOAH default judgments on cases 1 – 3, and issue final orders consistent with staff's recommendations. Second was made by Ms. Glasscock, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

B. Contested Cases

Proposal for Decision

1. Docket No. 701-22-0254.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v Jeanette Motaghi; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: Respondent should not be sanctioned

Staff Recommendation: Accept recommendation of ALJ

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and issue a final order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation. Second was made by Dr. Brescia, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

C. Court Cases

District Court Cases

1. Bradley Keith Bowen v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division; No. 07-22-00190-CV; in the Seventh Court of Appeals, Amarillo, Texas, on Appeal from Cause No. D-1-GN-18-004203, in the 98th District Court of Travis County, Texas.
2. Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v. David Demiglio; No. 13-21-00331-CV; in the Court of Appeals for the Thirteenth Judicial District, Corpus Christi, Texas, On Appeal from Cause No. D-1-GN-20-001242, in the 353rd Judicial District for Travis County, Texas.

DISCUSSION ONLY**12. Discussion of SBEC Stakeholder Engagement**

Ms. Pogue presented this item to the Board. She reminded the Board that this item is a continuation of their July discussion regarding SBEC stakeholder engagement options of maintaining the current standing Educator Preparation Stakeholder Group (EPSG) or establishing an Educator Preparation Advisory Committee in rule to comply with Texas Government Code, 2110. Ms. Pogue provided a side-by-side of implications of each option and requested guidance from the Board as to which option they want staff to move forward with regarding stakeholder engagement. The SBEC chose to maintain the current structure of the EPSG.

Public Testimony:

Dr. Elizabeth Ward – TxATE

Ms. Carrie Griffith – Texas State Teachers Association

13. Discussion of Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 239, Student Services Certificates, Subchapter B, School Librarian Certificate, and Subchapter D, Reading Specialist Certificate

Mr. Pitre presented this item to the Board. Mr. Pitre provided the Board with a summary of previous Board discussion regarding the School Librarian and Reading Specialist standards along with time a timeline of proposed next steps following SBEC adoption of the revised School Librarian and Reading Specialist standards. Mr. Pitre clarified for the Board that the effective date of September 1, 2023 indicated in the item would be shifted to better align with the anticipated launch of the respective redesigned School Librarian and Reading Specialist exams. Board members briefly shared additional positive feedback concerning the content of the standards and the standards' alignment to demands in the field and state priorities.

14. Discussion of Effective Preparation Framework Development

Ms. McLoughlin presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin provided the Board with background information on the Board's decision to develop an Effective Preparation Framework (EPF), the intended purposes of the framework, and design considerations TEA staff implemented at the Board's direction. Ms. McLoughlin shared information about the development process to date, including the role the Educator Preparation Stakeholder Group (EPSG) EPF working group has played in leading the framework development. Ms. McLoughlin then shared information about work already underway to support implementation of the EPF, including the developing of an EPF website, the establishing of a small EPP quality review pilot, and providing aligned training opportunities for EPPs. Ms. McLoughlin asked the Board if they had any initial reflections on the framework content or additional guidance for staff. Board members provided positive feedback on the content of the framework and the utility of the framework to support movement towards EPP continuous improvement.

The SBEC recessed at 11:10 AM.

The SBEC reconvened at 11:50 AM.

15. Discussion of the Special Education Certification Redesign and Test Development Updates

Ms. McLoughlin and Mr. Pitre presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin presented the Board with background information around the development and timeline for the discussion item, as well as foundational data around the production of special educators in Texas. Ms. McLoughlin reviewed the Special Education and Deafblind certification redesign timeline. Mr. Pitre reviewed the proposed updated Special Education and proposed new Deafblind certification pathways. Mr. Pitre reviewed the topics for additional stakeholder input for the proposed pathways. Mr. Pitre reviewed the connection between the special education agenda item to the proposed rulemaking items. Mr. Pitre reviewed the current and future exam development timeline. Ms. McLoughlin named for the Board how the implementation of a performance-based assessment could support the work of the Board to streamline certification exams for candidates, as well as additional details around the redesign of the ESL and Bilingual exams. Chair Streepey asked whether the questions raised in public testimony are on the radar of the agency and expressed excitement about the EC-12 Specialist exam. Dr. Rodriguez thanked the agency for working to streamline certification exams and asked for clarification around the base certifications required for Deafblind certification and personnel assignments for those staff. Dr. Rodriguez asked for clarification around personnel assignments tied to the updated Core Subjects EC-6 with Special Education, and whether the Special Education Specialist EC-12 would also function as a supplemental exam. Chair Streepey asked for clarification around whether the EC-12 exam would function as both an initial and supplemental exam, and the impacts on the teacher shortage. Dr. Galvan asked for clarification around the EC-6 exam and scoring implications for that exam.

Public Testimony:

Ms. Kaycee Bennett – Self

16. Discussion of Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification, Subchapter A, General Provisions, and Subchapter C, Assessment of Educators

Ms. McLoughlin and Mr. Pitre presented this item to the Board which provided an opportunity for the Board to discuss proposed amendments to Ch. 230. Mr. Pitre shared with the Board that the amendments are divided into two categories: changes to the testing figure and changes to uses of certification exams, test attempt waivers, and test exemptions. Mr. Pitre then outlined for the Board changes to the testing figure that would reflect technical edits, provide flexibility for EC-6 candidates seeking standard certification using the edTPA, add edTPA portfolio options for candidates seeking certification in Health Science and aligned CTE fields, strike through retired exams and add “with the Science of Teaching Reading” where applicable, and add new Tamil EC-12 certification exam. Ms. McLoughlin followed the changes to the testing figure by sharing with the Board proposed

amendments that would clarify the definition of “pilot exam”, decrease the time a candidate must wait before they can submit a test-limit waiver application from their most recent exam attempt, remove the waiting period for test limit waivers after denial, decrease days a candidate must wait for a second test limit waiver application, provide additional certification recommendation clarity, and clarify exam exemptions for candidates who identify as Deaf and Hard of Hearing.

Public Testimony:

Dr. Gina Anderson – TWU/ADoT

Ms. Kelsey Kling – Texas AFT

17. Discussion of Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 233, Categories of Classroom Teaching Certificates

Ms. Cook presented this item to the Board. She explained the purpose of the Chapter 233 rules and their importance to identify every content area and grade level of classroom teacher certificate issued by the Board. Ms. Cook highlighted the proposed changes for the Board’s consideration and shared that many of the edits are technical in nature to remove references to deadlines to use passing test scores and to remove classroom certificates no longer issued by the SBEC. Ms. Cook confirmed that while certificates no longer being issued by the SBEC will be removed from rule, they are still valid credentials that can be renewed and used for placement into teaching assignments. Ms. Cook referenced the earlier presentation from Ms. McLoughlin and Mr. Pitre around the three proposed new special education certificates and referenced where those certificates would be added to the Board’s rules for classroom teaching certificates. Ms. Cook also explained the proposed update to cosmetology credential references as related to the Trade and Industrial Education certificate. Ms. Cook also explained the proposed addition of a new Tamil certificate to the Board’s list of foreign language certificates. Dr. Galvan asked a question about the proposed new special education certificates and wanted to know the rationale around why there was no special education for grades 4-8. Ms. Cook called on Ms. McLoughlin to respond to Dr. Galvan’s question. Ms. McLoughlin explained the rationale to first focus on the early childhood to grade 6 certification range and the stakeholder feedback around how best to split grade-banded standards and accompanying exams for licensure to best support the field. There were no additional questions from the Board.

18. Discussion of Internship Requirements

Ms. McLoughlin presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin provided an overview of the Board’s current requirement that internships must be conducted in an “actual school setting” and how educator preparation rules, certification exams, and teacher and principal surveys in their current forms align with this requirement. Ms. McLoughlin then provided an overview of Senate Bill 15, 87th Legislature, Second Special Session, sharing that the bill included permissive language for the Board to consider rules to allow for internships to be conducted in a virtual setting. Ms. McLoughlin then presented three potential options for the Board’s consideration moving forward regarding internships in a virtual setting, including maintaining current rules, moving to allow for internships in a virtual setting, or directing staff to bring back additional information on developing a separate virtual teaching certificate. Mr. Gore shared that as the chair of the Texas Commission on Virtual Education that he would

recommend pausing on any further recommendations until the commission makes its recommendations and the legislature considers additional action. Board members shared that this was an opportunity to proactively research best practices in this arena while the commission finalizes its recommendations.

Public Testimony:

Ms. Carrie Griffith – Texas State Teachers Association

19. Discussion of A+ Texas Teachers Educator Preparation Program's Agreed Order

Ms. McLoughlin and Ms. Ayers presented this item to the Board. Ms. Ayers provided an overview of the activity to date pertaining to the A+ Texas Teachers Agreed Order that was signed by the SBEC at the July 22, 2022 meeting, including a brief description of the events leading to the Agreed Order followed by a timeline of activity since the Agreed Order was signed. Ms. Ayers shared that TEA and the educator preparation program (EPP) staff have established a consistent weekly communication where TEA provides guidance and responds to the program's questions. Mr. Calvin Stocker who is named as Monitor in the Agreed Order presented an update to the SBEC on his progress to date with the EPP. Mr. Stocker shared that he meets with the A+ Texas Teachers team prior to the weekly meeting with TEA to ensure understanding of the applicable Texas Administrative Code and the elements of the Agreed Order, to discuss process improvements, and to prepare for the submission of evidence to TEA as required in the Agreed Order. Dr. Muri, Dr. Galvan, and Ms. Streepey asked various questions about the progress and practices to date, including any tangible evidence regarding progress toward meeting the Agreed Order and asked for an update in December. Mr. Stocker responded that staff are working the plan and that there have been three high priority action areas identified including admission practices, requirements for the 30 hours of field-based experiences, and processes for ensuring intern candidates have mentors. Ms. McLoughlin reminded the SBEC of the specific parameters of the Agreed Order and identified we will have an update with more concrete information based on evidence at the next SBEC meeting. Dr. Muri asked for clarification of the organization name stating transparency about their name is important. Ms. Ayers responded the EPP's approved name in the Business Partner Directory is A+ Texas Teachers but they have periodically operated under several different variations of that name. Dr. Muri asked if we have other EPPs that may be having problems and if the SBEC has the information and tools to monitor programs that may need improvement.

Invited Testimony:

Mr. Calvin Stocker – Assigned Monitor

The SBEC recessed at 2:03 PM.

The SBEC reconvened at 2:20 PM.

20. Discussion of Teacher Performance Assessment Options

Ms. McLoughlin presented this item. Ms. McLoughlin started by providing a summary of the key takeaways from the stakeholder panels held during the July and September work sessions focused on teacher performance assessment. Ms. McLoughlin then reminded the

Board of the options they had discussed the previous day and shared the notes that SBEC members had provided for each option. After the Board's discussion of the three options, Chair Streepey provided direction to staff to bring a discussion item to the Board in December to implement a performance assessment in Chapter 230 as a certification exam with additional options that could be available for programs, including what the options would entail and how programs would be held accountable.

Public Testimony:

Mr. Esdras Cantao – Certify Teacher

Dr. Jill Fox – Certify Teacher

Mr. Otto Fanini – Certify Teacher

Mr. Dan Sanders – Certify Teacher

Ms. Carrie Griffith – Texas State Teachers Association

Ms. Mary Lowe – Families Engaged for Effective Education

Dr. Suzanne Nesmith – Baylor University/TCEP

Dr. Andrea Chevalier – Association of Texas Professional Educators

INFORMATION ONLY

21. Update of State Board for Educator Certification Enabling Legislation from the 87th Texas Legislature

22. Board Operating Policies and Procedures (BOPP)

23. 2019–2022 Rule Review Plan for State Board for Educator Certification Rules

24. Adjournment

Chair Streepey adjourned the meeting at 4:32 PM.

25. Statutory Citations

The Board may go into closed session regarding any item on the agenda to the extent it is authorized to do so pursuant to the Texas Open Meetings Act, Texas Government Code, Chapter 551. The presiding officer of the Board intends to be physically present in Room 1-104, William B. Travis Building, 1701 North Congress Avenue. Some members may attend via videoconferencing.