

Item 5:
**Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Request to
Approve May 1, 2020 Board Meeting Minutes**

ACTION

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the May 1, 2020 Board meeting minutes.

STATE BOARD FOR EDUCATOR CERTIFICATION
MEETING AGENDA
MAY 1, 2020 AT 8:30 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING (LIVESTREAM ON [ADMINMONITOR.COM](https://adminmonitor.com))

The Board will meet virtually and after determining the presence of a quorum, deliberate and possibly take formal action, including emergency action, on any of the following agenda items:

Information regarding registering for public comment can be found at:
<https://tea.texas.gov/about-tea/leadership/state-board-for-educator-certification/sbec-meetings>

Pledge of Allegiance

1. Call to Order

The State Board for Educator Certification (SBEC) convened its virtual meeting at 8:31 AM on Friday, May 1, 2020 via Zoom Meetings.

Present: Ms. Laurie Bricker, Ms. Rohanna Brooks-Sykes, Dr. Arturo Cavazos, Mr. Tommy Coleman, Ms. Jill Druessedow, Dr. John Kelly, Dr. Andrew Lofters, Ms. Courtney MacDonald, Ms. Shareefah Mason, Ms. Sandie Mullins, Ms. Kelvey Oeser, Mr. Jose Rodriguez, and Dr. Laurie Turner.

Absent: Dr. Edward Hill and Mr. Carlos Villagrana.

2. Associate Commissioner's Comments Regarding the SBEC Agenda

Associate Commissioner Ryan Franklin welcomed and thanked the Board for participating in the meeting via a virtual setting. Mr. Franklin thanked the staff at the Texas Education Agency (TEA) for pivoting to teleworking quickly and efficiently to support educators across the state.

3. Public Comment

The Board shall allocate up to thirty (30) minutes at the beginning of each regularly scheduled meeting of the full Board for public comment on non-agenda and consent agenda items. In accordance with SBEC Board Operating Policies and Procedures, late registration for providing oral or written comment will be accepted up to 30 minutes prior to the beginning of the Board meeting.

CONSENT AGENDA**4. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Request to Approve February 21, 2020 Board Meeting Minutes**

The February 21, 2020 meeting minutes were approved.

DISCUSSION AND ACTION**5. Update on the Coronavirus (COVID-19) Disaster Declaration and SBEC-Related Implications**

Mr. Franklin presented this item to the Board. Mr. Franklin explained the measures taken by TEA to coordinate the flow of information regarding the Coronavirus (COVID-19) Disaster Declaration to impacted educator certification candidates, educator preparation programs (EPPs), and school districts. Mr. Franklin highlighted the frequent communication TEA staff has had with those in the field to address problems and provide guidance during a pandemic-affected climate.

Mr. Franklin summarized Governor Abbott's waivers regarding educator preparation, which allow for reduced hours and non-traditional or virtual instruction for clinical teaching, internship, and field-based experience requirements for the spring or summer of 2020. Mr. Franklin explained that the Governor's waiver also created the possibility for additional candidates to receive a one-year probationary certificate.

Dr. Turner asked if a second wave of COVID-19 arrives in November, will these new rules apply to candidates in the middle of the 2020–2021 academic year. Mr. Franklin explained TEA staff is currently working on scenario planning for the upcoming school year to address these issues.

Ms. Oeser thanked public commenters and stressed that TEA's priorities are to support educators during this time through setting priorities with CARES Act funding, providing diagnostic resources, offering trainings to the field, and creating distance learning resources.

Public Comment was provided by:
Beth Maloch
Roxanne Schroeder-Arce

6. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Adoption of Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 232, General Certification Provisions

Ms. Pogue and Mr. Rodriguez presented this item to the Board. Ms. Pogue explained the purpose of the proposal was to provide major clean-up and reorganization of the chapter for clarity and to implement recent legislation as a result of the 86th Texas Legislative Session. She pointed out the process and timeline with internal/external stakeholders. She noted the legislative changes regarding continuing professional education requirements related to mental health and substance abuse for educators; sexual abuse, human trafficking, and other maltreatment of children for superintendents; and the prohibition of student loan default for certification renewal. She explained that SBEC does not establish the training components for these mandatory trainings but provides for the compliance procedures for educator certificate renewal purposes.

Mr. Rodriguez explained that the purpose of the proposal was to update the chapter to reflect changes in the fingerprinting workflow. Mr. Rodriguez categorized the updates as changes to technology and/or process. As background, he explained that TEA/SBEC uses the fingerprint vendor selected by the Texas Department of Public Safety. Therefore, as necessary, TEA/SBEC made enhancements to its IT systems when the fingerprint vendor rolled-out new technology requiring updates.

Ms. Pogue stated that nineteen public comments were received during the public comment period and none of those were in opposition to the proposed rule text.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Brooks-Sykes to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 232, General Certification Provisions, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was provided by Dr. Kelly and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

7. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 227, Provisions for Educator Preparation Candidates, Subchapter A, Admission to Educator Preparation Programs

Ms. McLoughlin and Dr. Olofson presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin explained that the proposed changes to 19 TAC Chapters 227, 228, 230, 233, and 235 were necessary to the implementation of replacement certification names for the implementation of the HB 3 Science of Teaching Reading requirement. She noted that the updated names for the certificates provided clarity to the field.

Dr. Olofson presented the proposed changes to 19 TAC Chapter 227. He explained that the amendments introduce the Science of Teaching Reading certificates into the Pre-Admission Content Test (PACT) chart. He also explained the additional updates to the Board, including the removal of the one-year expiration date for passing a PACT exam, and other technical cleanup.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 227, Provisions for Educator Preparation Candidates, Subchapter A, Admission to Educator Preparation Programs, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was provided by Mr. Rodriguez and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

8. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs

Dr. Jones presented this item to the Board. Dr. Jones outlined the proposed major revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 228, specifically noting the three changes that had been made since the last SBEC meeting on February 21st that included the replacement certificates for the HB 3 impacted certificates that include science of teaching reading, curriculum revisions for teacher and principal certification classes that align to the board approved educator standards, and aligning the coursework and/or training for initial teacher certification to the board approved educator standards.

Dr. Lofters asked if the EPPs would be sending documents to approve at the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board regarding the replacement certificates. Dr. Jones indicated that the replacement certificates were replacing already approved certification areas and no additional approval was necessary.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Druesedow to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was provided by Mr. Coleman and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

9. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Proposed Amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification, Subchapter C, Assessment of Educators, §230.21, Educator Assessment

Ms. McLoughlin presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin explained that the proposed changes to TAC Chapter 230 Subchapter C would update the testing figure based on the House Bill 3 science of teaching reading requirement, adding the replacement certificate names for the impacted certificates and the associated certification exam requirements with operational dates to the figure. She also explained two additional proposed changes to the figure, the first to phase out the retired 183 Braille Texas examination and the second to update the test number for the Educational Diagnostician exam from 251 to 253 to align with test numbering conventions. Ms. McLoughlin explained that the second technical edit was made after publication, and therefore, the Board was being presented substitute rule text.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Mullins to approve the proposed amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification, Subchapter C, Assessment of Educators, §230.21, Educator Assessment, as presented, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was provided by Ms. Brooks-Sykes and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

10. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 233, Categories of Classroom Teaching Certificates

Ms. Cook presented this item to the Board. She explained that Chapter 233 lists all of the classroom teaching certificates issued by the SBEC. Ms. Cook stated this item would add the following four replacement certificates (specific to the science of teaching reading) to this rule chapter: Core Subjects with Science of Teaching Reading: Early Childhood–Grade 6; Core Subjects with Science of Teaching Reading: Grades 4–8; English Language Arts and Reading with Science of Teaching Reading: Grades 4–8; and English Language Arts and Reading/Social Studies with Science of Teaching Reading: Grades 4–8. Ms. Cook explained that this item will ensure the successful implementation of House Bill 3 requirements by January 1, 2021. She highlighted the issuance deadlines for the four current certificate areas to be replaced by the STR-focused certificates. Ms. Cook also explained a technical edit to 233.1(e) that would align references to an initial standard certificate. There were no questions from the Board.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Brooks-Sykes to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 233, Categories of Classroom Teaching Certificates, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was provided by Ms. Druessedow and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

11. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards

Ms. McLoughlin presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin explained that proposed amendments to TAC Chapter 235 remain the same as presented at discussion outside of minor technical edits. Ms. McLoughlin explained that the proposed amendments would update the organization of the science of teaching reading standards based on the House Bill 3 mandate to ensure that they are applicable to educators who will teach students in Grades EC–6, add the Bilingual Spanish Standards, Special Education EC–6 and 6–12 Standards, and the DeafBlind EC–12 Standards into rule, and update rule text related to implementation dates.

Ms. McLoughlin shared that the item received extensive written public comment in support of the DeafBlind standards. She also reminded the board that the educator standards have been developed and vetted through extensive stakeholder engagement and have gone through rounds of refinement based on stakeholder and board member feedback.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Druessedow to approve the proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was provided by Ms. Brooks-Sykes and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

12. Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Petition for Adoption of Rule Change Concerning 19 TAC Chapter 227, Provisions for Educator Preparation Candidates, Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs, and Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification

Ms. Pogue presented this item to the Board. Ms. Pogue explained the requirements, processes, and options when an interested party submits a petition for rulemaking to the SBEC. She presented the four petitions for rulemaking that were submitted to the SBEC at the February 21, 2020 Board meeting. She clarified the rule text changes requested by the petitioner, the impact of each rule change, and the recommendation by TEA staff.

The SBEC provided the following comments for denial:

- The current two-test attempt for accountability parallels some aspects of the K–12 system;
- The SBEC wants to strengthen the profession at every possible turn and the Board has adopted rules for educator preparation programs to prepare teachers that are sound;
- The SBEC does not want to consider rules that soften or water down the profession and wants to stand firm with what the Board has set as a precedent; and

- Current educator preparation candidates are struggling when confronted with the realities of the classroom, and the Board desires to uphold what was put in place to ensure educator preparation programs are making necessary adjustments to ensure that all teachers are fully trained.

Public Comment was provided by:

Dr. Diann Huber

Dr. Rae Queen

Ms. Lindsay Sobel

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Rodriguez to deny the petitions for rulemaking. Second was provided by Mr. Coleman and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

The SBEC recessed at 10:16 AM.

The SBEC reconvened at 10:28 AM.

DISCIPLINARY CASES

13. Pending or Contemplated Litigation, including Disciplinary Cases

A. Defaults

No Answer Defaults

2. In the Matter of Angelica Maria Castillo; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

3. In the Matter of Jose Leandro Flores; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

4. In the Matter of Jamian Hoff; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

5. In the Matter of Julia R. Johnson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

6. In the Matter of Olivia Danielle McGlothen; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

7. In the Matter of Kevin Earl Niemeyer; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

8. In the Matter of Elizabeth Oliver; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

9. In the Matter of Gessner A. Soto; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

10. In the Matter of Allison F. Townsend-Bush; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Suspension of probationary certificate until expiration on August 12, 2020

11. In the Matter of Candace Dollene Williams; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

12. In the Matter of Sam Fanek; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

13. In the Matter of Brandie Renae Jones; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation

14. In the Matter of Melissa Jo Mauger; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
15. In the Matter of Jose Ernesto Villalobos; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
16. In the Matter of Jonathan Proud; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
17. In the Matter of Courtney Schree Hill; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
18. In the Matter of Jacob Pena; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
21. In the Matter of Adrian Balderas; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Revocation
22. In the Matter of Jordan J. Jordan; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Revocation
23. In the Matter of Sherry Glass Murdock; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
25. In the Matter of Ramon Rivera, Jr.; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
Staff recommendation: Revocation

26. In the Matter of Chad Taylor Carter; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

27. In the Matter of Julie Maupin; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension

28. In the Matter of Olivia Judith Preciado; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman to approve Staff's request for the issuance of default judgements and issue final orders consistent with Staff's recommendations on the above numbered cases 1–28, except numbers 1, 20 and 24. Second was made by Mr. Rodriguez, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

20. In the Matter of William Joseph Alvarez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

Ms. Brooks-Sykes recused herself from voting on this matter.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Druesedow to approve Staff's request for the issuance of default judgment and enter a final order consistent with Staff's recommendation. Second was made by Mr. Coleman, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

24. In the Matter of Alison Lyn Rabinovitz; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman to approve Staff's request for the issuance of default judgment and enter a final order with a sanction of Revocation. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

The following case was pulled by TEA Staff; no action was taken:

1. In the Matter of Jessica Lorraine Cabrales; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Suspension of Intern certificate until expiration on August 26, 2020

B. SOAH Defaults

1. In the Matter of Jonathan Burton; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

2. In the Matter of Jacqueline Ibarra; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation

3. In the Matter of Yolanda Jordan; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

4. In the Matter of Latifah Lorraine Adeniran; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: Revocation

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Brooks-Sykes to approve Staff's request for the issuance of SOAH default judgments and enter final orders consistent with Staff's recommendation on each of the above numbered cases. Second was made by Mr. Rodriguez, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

B. Contested Cases**Proposals for Decision**

1. Docket No. 701200122.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Leadership and Quality Division v. John Miller; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: 2-year suspension

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

Mr. Hensley represented TEA staff. Mr. Miller represented himself.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Rodriguez that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and Issue a Final Order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation. Mr. Miller's educator certificate should be suspended for two (2) years. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

2. Docket No. 701195728.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Leadership and Quality Division v. Ebony Morrow; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: 8-month suspension

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

Mr. Duncan represented TEA staff. Respondent did not appear.

Ms. Brooks-Sykes recused herself from voting on this matter.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Druesedow that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and Issue a Final Order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation. Ms. Morrow's educator certificate should be suspended for eight (8) months. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the motion passed with Ms. Bricker, Dr. Cavazos, Ms. Druesedow, Dr. Kelly, Ms. MacDonald, Ms. Mason, Ms. Mullins, Mr. Rodriguez, and Dr. Turner voting in favor of the motion, and Mr. Coleman voting against the motion.

3. Docket No. 701196550.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Leadership and Quality Division v. Jessica Samaniego; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: No disciplinary action to be taken

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

4. Mr. Ybarra represented TEA staff. Mr. Lungwitz represented Jessica Samaniego. The parties agreed to waive oral argument in favor of responding to Board members' questions.

Motion was made by Ms. Brooks-Sykes that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and Issue a Final Order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation. No disciplinary action should be taken against Ms. Samaniego's educator certificates. Second was made by Dr. Turner, and the motion passed with Ms. Bricker, Dr. Cavazos, Ms.

Druessedow, Dr. Kelly, Ms. MacDonald, Ms. Mason, Ms. Mullins, Mr. Rodriguez, and Dr. Turner voting in favor of the motion, and Mr. Coleman voting against the motion.

5. Docket No. 701196573.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Leadership and Quality Division v. Jeremiah Willis; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: No disciplinary action to be taken

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

Mr. Hensley represented TEA staff. Mr. McCormick represented Mr. Willis.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and Issue a Final Order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation. No disciplinary action should be taken against Mr. Willis's educator certificates. Second was made by Ms. Brooks-Sykes and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

C. Court Cases

District Court Cases

1. David Turner v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-17-002298, In the 250th District Court of Travis County, Texas.
2. Bradley Keith Bowen v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-18-004203, In the 98th District Court of Travis County, Texas.
3. Blake Tittle v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-18-007716, In the 345th District Court of Travis County, Texas.
4. Cynthia Maria Garcia v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-18-007719, In the 250th District Court of Travis County, Texas.
5. Christopher Greene v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-18-000016, In the 345th District Court of Travis County, Texas.
6. Gilbert Salas v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-19-008786, In the 345th District Court of Travis County, Texas.

7. David Demiglio v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division; Cause No. D-1-GN-20-001242, In the 459th District Court of Travis County, Texas.

DISCUSSION ONLY

14. Discussion of Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs

Dr. Olofson and Ms. Foots presented this item to the board. Dr. Olofson explained that the changes for discussion included accreditation statuses in response to the ongoing COVID-19 state of disaster, the ASEP index, a student growth indicator, and the ASEP manual.

With regard to the accreditation statuses, Dr. Olofson explained that the discussed rule text provided a status of Not Rated: Declared status of disaster for all EPPs. He noted that this would minimize the impact of the lack of accountability data, that this year would not function in counts of years, and that this would follow the approach in the K–12 system.

Dr. Olofson explained the purpose of the ASEP index, to combine all the accountability indicators into one continuum. He noted that the system allows for weighting of the indicators and for flexibility as new indicators are operationalized. He highlighted that the index was developed with stakeholders including the Data Working Group, and that for the first year of implementation EPPs would receive the better result of the new system and the old system. Dr. Olofson showed the current weights for consideration and noted that staff would continue to work with stakeholders to further develop this system.

Ms. Foots explained the development work for the student growth indicator, including the history, stakeholder group, and initial analyses. She elaborated that the model uses the STAAR student growth value aggregated at the teacher level, which is then aggregated at the EPP level similar to other ASEP standards. Ms. Foots noted that while these data would be disrupted by the ongoing COVID-19 situation, staff would update rule text for proposal to align with the K–12 approach.

Dr. Kelly asked if there were EPPs that would be disadvantaged by there being no accountability rating for 2019–2020. Dr. Olofson and Mr. Franklin explained that the data is incomplete and not being collected for the rest of the year. Dr. Kelly asked about the weighting of the content pedagogy exam and the responsibilities of different types of EPPs to instruct candidates. Dr. Olofson explained that the exams included in the indicator were the content pedagogy exams, which included assessment on how to teach content. Ms. Bricker thanked the staff for their work on this chapter and asked for any feedback from EPPs. Dr. Cavazos reiterated the importance of modeling the cut scores with relevant data. Dr. Lofters asked about the meaning of the student growth indicator scale, and Ms. Foots explained it in the context of the STARR student growth value. Dr. Lofters asked for additional clarity about the content pedagogy exams. Ms. McLoughlin provided additional clarity about the exam content and frameworks.

Public Comment was provided by:
Dr. Glenda Ballard
Dr. Rae Queen
Dr. Diann Huber

15. Discussion of the Science of Teaching Reading Transition and Test Development Updates

Ms. McLoughlin presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin explained that the item provides an update on communication related to the science of teaching requirement transition and test development timelines. Regarding communication related to the science of teaching reading transition, Ms. McLoughlin provided an overview of communication with the field to date and plans for ongoing communication related to STR implementation requirements and timelines and STR exam specifications and curriculum alignment. Ms. McLoughlin shared that staff recognize overall that the statutory requirement, which goes into effect January 1, 2021, requires a compressed implementation timeline and acknowledge that there are real structural challenges for programs and candidates to comply with the requirements in legislation, which have now only been compounded by COVID-19. She assured the board that staff would do everything in their power to ensure that the transition is as smooth as possible, providing communication, timelines, and resources wherever they can.

Ms. McLoughlin also provided the Board with an update on test development timelines, including an update to the Physical Education exam timeline, moving the anticipated launch date from September 1, 2021 to a to be determined launch date due to the Physical Education TEKS review cycle.

Mr. Rodriguez asked Ms. McLoughlin to share more about LETRS training. Ms. McLoughlin shared that LETRS training includes both teacher and administrator training on best practices in the science of teaching reading. Mr. Rodriguez applauded the connection between teachers and administrators in the training. He also shared that, as an educator, he would be reviewing the best practices when working with his students, reinforcing that the science of teaching reading knowledge and skills are critical for student success and important for all educators to revisit.

The SBEC recessed at 12:01 PM.

The SBEC reconvened at 12:11 PM.

16. Discussion of Certificate Options for Legacy Master Teachers

Ms. Cook presented this item to the Board. Ms. Cook provided a brief overview of the provisions in House Bill 3 that required effective September 1, 2019, the SBEC can no longer issue or renew master teacher certificates and discussed the Board's October 4, 2019 action to repeal 19 TAC Chapter 239, Subchapter E, Master Teacher Certificate. She also referenced the February 2020 discussion item on Chapter 231, Requirements for Personnel Assignments, that will add Legacy Master Teacher references to the assignment rules slated to be presented to the Board in July. Ms. Cook shared that during the February 2020 SBEC meeting the Board received a letter from Chairman Huberty clarifying the intent of the legislation and a desire for the SBEC to use its statutory authority to support the continuing role of legacy master teacher certificate holders.

Ms. Cook stated there are 4,997 legacy master teacher certificate holders and provided an update on the April 15, 2020 stakeholder meeting convened to discuss options for legacy master teacher certificate holders. Ms. Cook first thanked the 10 participants from

professional organizations. She highlighted the two options presented to stakeholders and the third one raised for consideration:

- Option 1 to convert legacy master teachers from standard certificates with expiration dates to certificates with “Valid” status and no expiration
- Option 2 to create a new SBEC certificate and issue to all Legacy Master Teacher certificate holders
- Option 3 to allow Legacy Master Teachers the option to renew their credentials every five years

Ms. Cook emphasized that everyone’s goal was to find a pathway that provided solutions for legacy master teacher certificate holders to be able to continue making contributions to districts and students. Ms. Cook confirmed we do not have the statutory authority/legislative reach to make Option 3 work. She highlighted the rationales and issues/implications for Options 1 and 2 presented for consideration by the SBEC.

Ms. Cook completed her initial presentation of the item. Following public comment from Ms. Chevalier, Ms. Cook thanked the Board for their time and asked for direction on how to proceed. Ms. Cook assured the Board that she would do her due diligence and return with a thoughtful proposal for consideration that was statutorily sound and provides a resolution.

Mr. Rodriguez, Ms. Brooks-Sykes, Dr. Kelly, Dr. Turner, and Dr. Lofters provided comments and confirmed their support of Option 1. Their comments included cost savings to certificate holders, support for and recognition of the hard work and time put in by these educators to achieve legacy master teacher status, and alignment with legislative intent to offer solution to a problem.

Dr. Cavazos reminded Ms. Cook that if she is unable to resolve the IT issues to implement the proposed solution, she may need to get a good pen to handcraft updated certificates.

Public Comment was provided by:
Andrea Chevalier

17. Update on Voluntary Closure of Training via E-Learning Alternative Certification (TEACH) Preparation Program

Dr. Jones presented this informational item to the Board. Dr. Jones explained that the EPP had an agreed order that was approved by the SBEC at the December 6, 2019 meeting that included not admitting any new candidates into the EPP until required approved curriculum documents were in place for each certification area. In a compliance status check conducted on January 28, 2020, two new candidates were found to have been accepted into the EPP in two different certification areas after the December 6 SBEC meeting in violation of the order. The EPP was notified of the violation and opted to voluntarily close in lieu of revocation with an effective date of June 15, 2020.

INFORMATION ONLY

18. Board Operating Policies and Procedures (BOPP)

Information only.

19. 2019–2022 Updated Rule Review Plan for State Board for Educator Certification Rules

Information only.

20. Requests from Board Members for Future Agenda Items

21. Requests Received from the Board Since Last Meeting

22. Adjournment

Dr. Cavazos adjourned the meeting at 12:39 PM.

The Board may go into closed session regarding any item on the agenda to the extent it is authorized to do so pursuant to the Texas Open Meetings Act, Texas Government Code, Chapter 551.