

**Item 5:**  
**Request to Approve July 21, 2023 Board Meeting Minutes**

**ACTION**

**ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION:**

Approve the July 21, 2023 Board meeting minutes.

**STATE BOARD FOR EDUCATOR CERTIFICATION**  
**MEETING AGENDA**  
**JULY 21, 2023 AT 8:30 AM**  
**1701 N. CONGRESS AVE. ROOM 1-104**

The Board will meet in open session and after determining the presence of a quorum, deliberate and possibly take formal action, including emergency action, on any of the following agenda items:

**Moment of Silence**

**Pledge of Allegiance**

**1. Call to Order**

The State Board for Educator Certification (SBEC) convened its meeting at 8:35 AM on Friday, July 21, 2022.

Present: Dr. Robert Brescia, Dr. Veronica Galvan, Mr. Rex Gore, Ms. Courtney MacDonald, Dr. Scott Muri, Dr. Emma Gelsinger, Ms. Kelvey Oeser, Dr. Alma Rodriguez, Ms. Jean Streepey, and Mr. Tommy Coleman.

Absent: Ms. Julia Dvorak, Ms. Cristina Galindo, Ms. Bena Glasscock, Dr. Michael McFarland, and Mr. Josue Tamarez Torres.

**2. Associate Commissioner's Comments Regarding the SBEC Agenda**

Ms. Garcia thanked the Educator Preparation Program University and district partners that shared their experiences from the field during the SBEC Work Session. She also thanked Texas Education Agency (TEA) staff for their coordination and organization.

**3. Public Comment**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

Ms. McCain presented this item to the Board. She explained the purpose and logistics of the consent agenda. The consent agenda took up agenda items 4 – 10 with no discussion.

**4. *Request to Approve April 28, 2023 Meeting Minutes***

**5. *Proposed Review of 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification***

**6. *Proposed Review of 19 TAC Chapter 239, Student Services Certificates***

7. ***Adoption of Review of 19 TAC Chapter 244, Certificate of Completion of Training for Appraisers***
8. ***Adoption of Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 231, Requirements for Public School Personnel Assignments, Subchapter C, Grades 6–8 Assignments, and Subchapter E, Grades 9–12 Assignments***
9. ***Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Request to Approve New Class of Certificate at Austin Community College***
10. ***Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Request to Approve New Class of Certificate at Southern Methodist University***

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to approve consent agenda items 4 - 10. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**DISCUSSION AND ACTION**

**DISCIPLINARY CASES**

**11. Pending or Contemplated Litigation, including Disciplinary Cases**

**A. Defaults**

**No Answer Defaults**

1. In the Matter of Natasha Balkum; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
2. In the Matter of Miki Alexander; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
3. In the Matter of Sonja Tuttle; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
4. In the Matter of Justin Dunaway; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

5. In the Matter of Eligio Mares; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
6. In the Matter of Christina Aranda; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
7. In the Matter of Valerie Nesmith-Arechiga; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
8. In the Matter of Daniel Pena; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
9. In the Matter of Emily Castagno; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
10. In the Matter of Ronald Figgs; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
11. In the Matter of Arely Flores; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
12. In the Matter of Blake Orsak; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
13. In the Matter of Nicole Curfman; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

- 14. In the Matter of Megan Eppolito; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 15. In the Matter of Zachary Herbst; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 16. In the Matter of Helen Kuang; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 17. In the Matter of Kierra O'Neal; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Suspension until expiration of emergency permit on August 31, 2023
- 18. In the Matter of Jordan Packman; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 19. In the Matter of Scott Tarazona; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Suspension until expiration of certificates on
- 20. In the Matter of Hector Zapata; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 21. In the Matter of Kirstyn Zapata; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 22. In the Matter of Sarah Coffman; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

- 23. In the Matter of Jordan Cortez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 24. In the Matter of Roshanell Francisco; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 25. In the Matter of Chloe Henson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 11-month suspension
- 26. In the Matter of Jonathan Leach; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 27. In the Matter of Carlos Perez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 28. In the Matter of Sara Yuchnewicz; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 29. In the Matter of Adrian Sandlin; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 30. In the Matter of Amanda Guthrie; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
- 31. In the Matter of Nann Pringle; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension

32. In the Matter of Brittney Caldwell; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
33. In the Matter of Tamara Cockrum; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
34. In the Matter of Madison Bolton; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
35. In the Matter of Crissie Jacobs; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
36. In the Matter of Taylor Kopp; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
37. In the Matter of Delany Rawlings; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 11-month suspension
38. In the Matter of Quianna Scott; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
39. In the Matter of Halle Fleurant; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
40. In the Matter of Denise Perry; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Suspension until expiration of intern certificate on September 21, 2023

41. In the Matter of Amber Davis; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
42. In the Matter of Leilani Castillo; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
43. In the Matter of Terry Hill; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
44. In the Matter of Olivia Hobden; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
45. In the Matter of Russell Sassin; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
46. In the Matter of Eric Smith; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
47. In the Matter of Ifetayo West; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
48. In the Matter of Lauren Adkins; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Suspension until expiration of one-year certificate on July 31, 2023
49. In the Matter of Briyanna Alexander; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension



50. In the Matter of Rawley Farris; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
51. In the Matter of Kathryn Johnson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
52. In the Matter of Ubaid Khan; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Suspension until expiration of intern certificate on November 25, 2023
53. In the Matter of Laura Moreno; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
54. In the Matter of Alisha Rush; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
55. In the Matter of Kirstyn Casias; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
56. In the Matter of Michelle Turner; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
57. In the Matter of Chesley Walton; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Revocation
58. In the Matter of Edgar A. Anguilu; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension

59. In the Matter of Joseph Caldarera; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension
60. In the Matter of Mack Hamilton; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension
61. In the Matter of Gabriela A. Marquez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
62. In the Matter of Eric Rivas; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
63. In the Matter of Gilberto Escobedo; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation
64. In the Matter of Rogelio Handy, III; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 10-year suspension
65. In the Matter of Kimberly Kelley; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension
66. In the Matter of Le Ann Sibley; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 10-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
67. In the Matter of Jaimie B. Thompson; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
Staff recommendation: 10-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

68. In the Matter of Andrew D. Dienert; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 4-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
69. In the Matter of Brandy Mayfield; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 4-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
70. In the Matter of Emmanuel Ogweta; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
71. In the Matter of Seth Adam Myers; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
72. In the Matter of Carol Winfree; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
73. In the Matter of Ryan R. Knight; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
74. In the Matter of Amy R. Cole; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program
75. In the Matter of Patty Nunez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment
- Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

76. In the Matter of Rachael Lauren Chilton; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension and proof of successful completion of substance abuse treatment program

77. In the Matter of Michael Farr; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 3-year suspension

78. In the Matter of Lashovious D. Smith; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment

Staff recommendation: 5-year suspension

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Dr. Muri to grant staff's request for the issuance of default judgement on cases numbered 1 – 12, 14 – 20, 22, 24 – 31, 35 – 42, 44 – 47, 49 – 62, 65 – 68, 71, and 75 and issue final orders consistent with staff's recommendations. Second was made by Mr. Coleman, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order consistent with staff's recommendation on default case number 69. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order of a 4-year suspension and submit evidence of a successful completion of a substance abuse awareness class on default case number 70. Second was made by Dr. Muri, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order of a 4-year suspension and submit evidence of a successful completion of a substance abuse awareness class on default case number 72. Second was made by Mr. Coleman, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order of a 4-year suspension and submit evidence of a successful completion of a substance abuse awareness class on default case number 74. Second was made by Mr. Coleman, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order of a 2-year suspension and submit evidence of a successful completion of a substance abuse awareness class on default case number 76. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order with a sanction of Revocation on default case number 77. Second was made by Mr. Coleman, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to grant staff's request for issuance of default judgment and issue a final order with a sanction of Revocation on default case number 78. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**TEA staff pulled cases numbered 13, 21, 23, 32, 33, 34, 43, 48, 63, 64, and 73. No action was taken.**

**SOAH Defaults**

1. In the Matter of Martha Montoya; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: 2-year suspension
2. In the Matter of Mallory Brooke Peterman; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: 1-year suspension and proof of successful completion substance abuse treatment program
3. In the Matter of Cana Odom Hauerland; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment  
  
Staff recommendation: Revocation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman to grant staff's request for the issuance of SOAH default judgments 1-3 and enter a final order consistent with staff's recommendation. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**B. Contested Cases**

## Proposals for Decision

1. Docket No. 701-23-12402.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v Shalynn Wright; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: 1-year suspension

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and issue a final order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation that Ms. Wright's educator certificate be suspended for one year. Second was made by Dr. Muri, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

2. Docket No. 701-23-12401.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v Theresa Munguia; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: 1-year suspension

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and issue a final order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation that Ms. Munguia's educator certificate be suspended for one year. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

3. Docket No. 701-23-09280.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v Donovan Lopez; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: Permanent Revocation

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and issue a final order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation that Mr. Lopez's educator certificate be permanently revoked. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

4. Docket No. 701-23-00768.EC, Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v Isaiah Brown; Action to be taken: Consideration of Proposal for Decision and Issuance of Final Order.

ALJ Recommendation: No disciplinary action to be taken

Staff Recommendation: Accept ALJ recommendation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Coleman that the Board accept the Proposal for Decision and issue a final order consistent with the ALJ's recommendation that no disciplinary action be taken against Mr. Brown's educator certificates. Second was made by Mr. Gore, and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**C. Court Cases***District Court Cases*

1. Bradley Keith Bowen v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division; 03-22-00331-CV; In the Seventh Court of Appeals, Amarillo, Texas, on Appeal from Cause No. D-1-GN-18-004203, In the 98<sup>th</sup> District Court of Travis County, Texas.
2. Texas Education Agency, Educator Preparation, Certification, and Enforcement Division v. David Demiglio; No. 13-21-00331-CV; In the Court of Appeals for the Thirteenth Judicial District, Corpus Christi, Texas, On Appeal from Cause No. D-1-GN-20-001242, in the 353<sup>rd</sup> Judicial District for Travis County, Texas.

The SBEC recessed at 9:32 AM.

The SBEC reconvened at 9:42 AM.

**12. Consideration of Petition for Adoption of Rule Change Concerning 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs, §228.35. Preparation Program Coursework and/or Training**

Ms. McCain presented this item to the Board. Ms. McCain established that the petitioner has met the requirements for being a petitioner and has requested flexibility in Chapter 228 for internship and clinical teaching which Ms. McCain explained already exists in Chapter 228 and will continue to exist, so staff is recommending that the petition be denied.

Mr. Gore suggested revisiting options for virtual teaching in the future, and Ms. Streepey echoed Mr. Gore's sentiments. Both members agreed that this is a topic for future discussion. Dr. Muri noted that the requests of the petitioner already exist in current rule. Ms. Streepey requested clarification about the petitioner's request for online as opposed to face-to-face training currently existing in rule. Ms. Ayers clarified that current rules identify that assignments clinical teaching, internship, practicum assignments must be in a face-to-face setting and cannot be in a distance learning or a virtual environment.

Dr. Gelsing shared that the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board has encountered requests for options for virtual learning and Dr. Galvan shared her thoughts on placement and importance of face-to-face interactions with students, mentoring, and support systems. Ms. Garcia clarified that there is not flexibility for virtual placement for clinical experiences. She offered to bring back a discussion item in September if the Board would like staff to do a landscape analysis of where virtual options are working in the education and educator preparation spaces. Dr. Muri and Mr. Gore both noted that this topic may be visited at the summer special legislative sessions. Ms. Garcia confirmed Dr. Muri's suggestion to wait until after legislative session, and Ms. Streepey agreed with not directing the Board at this time. Dr. Gelsing wondered what data was available and the impact of virtual setting on educational outcomes.

The SBEC provided the following comments for denial:

- The petitioner's request for completing assignments on a part time basis are already in rule and SBEC's rule allows for flexibility with completing the assignments.

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Mr. Gore to deny the petition concerning clinical teaching and internship assignment requirements in 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs. Second was made by Ms. MacDonald and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

**13. Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs**

Dr. Olofson presented this item to the Board. He provided background on Chapter 229. He described updates to the handling of small groups in Indicator 4a and in year 3 small group calculations to provide flexibility for small educator preparation programs (EPPs) and described the findings of an analysis of the applicability of these policies. Dr. Olofson described updates addressing the retention of old statuses when there is not additional data and noted the results of the analysis related to this policy. He described the update to timeline language for continuing reviews and described technical updates to the manual. Finally, he noted the proposed update to the title of the teacher survey chapter and the future surveyed population.

Mr. Gore asked about the retention of survey data, and Dr. Olofson noted that the full data is retained in TEA data systems. Dr. Rodriguez suggested further clarification of the title of the teacher survey, and Dr. Olofson noted that staff could make this update along with the shift of surveyed population next year. Dr. Rodriguez asked for further clarification about the shift



in the surveyed population for the teacher survey, and Dr. Olofson noted the alignment with the principal survey language. Dr. Galvan asked for further clarification about the survey population and second year interns, and Dr. Olofson clarified the survey timing. Dr. Galvan asked about the 4-month timeline and Dr. Olofson clarified that this timeline would be after the compliance information is requested. Dr. Galvan asked about the EPP map, and Dr. Olofson noted that updates were forthcoming. Ms. Streepey and Dr. Galvan further commented on the timing of the survey and internships, and Dr. Olofson provided clarification. Dr. Rodriguez asked about indicator 1a and the relevant exams. Dr. Olofson noted the connection to Chapter 230 and that timing of shifts in the calculations currently in rule. Dr. Rodriguez further asked about impacts on programs, and Dr. Olofson noted the direct work with the field and the data made available to EPPs. He further noted that the Board provided flexibility for EPPs in the new index system.

The Board discussed the structure of the index system in comparison to the legacy system, as it related to failing standards for multiple years. Dr. Olofson described the legacy system and index system, noting that while both systems impact programs for failing multiple years in a row, the index system is more targeted as it requires the failure of the specific indicator and demographic group for multiple years. Dr. Gelsinger asked about prior issues with survey performance and the availability of making updates, and Ms. Garcia noted that Chapter 229 is considered annually. Dr. Gelsinger and Dr. Rodriguez noted timelines for change at institutions. The Board discussed data points that EPPs use to understand their performance. Dr. Rodriguez asked for further detail about the index calculations, and Dr. Olofson provided additional clarification about the calculations and weightings. The Board discussed that the teacher responses could be impacted by their context and the timeline, and Ms. Garcia confirmed that the weighting of the survey indicator was in part responsive to this concern. Ms. Streepey noted the importance of formative assessment, that the Board has updated the system, and noted the concerns from EPPs. Dr. Muri asked about the negative impact of continued failure, and Dr. Olofson noted that the Board approved a negative impact to help drive continuous improvement. Dr. Muri asked about technical support, and Dr. Olofson noted supports available from TEA and in the larger EPP ecosystem. Dr. Rodriguez noted the timeline for the availability of the survey data, and Ms. Oeser discussed the purpose and function of accountability systems. The Board discussed options related to timing, calculations, and data availability. Dr. Rodriguez asked about options for changes, and Dr. Olofson noted opportunities for the Board to make shifts in the applicability of the negative weights. Dr. Gelsinger asked about rulemaking procedures, and Ms. Wolfe clarified what options are available to the Board at which stages of rulemaking. Ms. Streepey noted the options for the Board, and Dr. Muri recommended continued monitoring of the issue. Dr. Gelsinger asked for clarification of the Board's authority for discretion, and Ms. Wolfe noted potential challenges to making retroactive changes. The Board further discussed the calculations of the index system and accreditation statuses. Dr. Galvan commented on the focus on the teacher survey, and Ms. Oeser noted the importance of understanding teacher feedback and the impact of the system.

Public Testimony:

Dr. Michael Vriesenga – One UTSA Circle

Dr. Elizabeth Ward – Texas Coalition for Educator Preparation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Dr. Muri to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs, to be published as proposed in the Texas Register. Second was made by Ms. McDonald and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

The SBEC recessed at 11:38 AM.

The SBEC reconvened at 12:19 PM.

**14. Discussion and Action Related to Implementation of the Effective Preparation Framework**

Ms. McLoughlin and Ms. Love presented this item to the Board. Ms. Love provided an update on the development of the Effective Preparation Framework (EPF) 1.0, the newest version of the EPF. Board members were provided an opportunity to reflect on the EPF and share what they are excited about and continued wonderings that they have. Ms. McLoughlin expressed deep gratitude to stakeholders in the development and refinement of the EPF 1.0, particularly the Educator Preparation Stakeholder Group (EPSG) working group, and the statewide survey participants.

Ms. McLoughlin summarized the plans for next steps to support operationalizing the EPF 1.0 including three core actions: redesigning the Continuing Approval Review (CAR) process, vetting third party technical assistance and professional services providers, and updating Commendation 4: Innovative EPP Practices. She welcomed and answered Board member questions related to the three proposed actions. Ms. McLoughlin shared that based on the direction from the SBEC, TEA Staff would coordinate extensive stakeholder engagement regarding the redesign of the continuing approval review process and, based on stakeholder input, bring back a discussion item in September with additional parameters, proposed timelines, and key deliverables for consideration before moving forward with formal next steps to implement the three key actions.

**Public Testimony:**

Ms. Kimberly Hughes – UTeach Institute at the University of Texas at Austin

Dr. Allison Skerrett – The University of Texas at Austin

Dr. Elizabeth Ward – Texas Coalition for Educator Preparation

By voicing no objections to the following actions, the SBEC directed TEA staff to:

- Initiate the procurement process for a vendor to redesign and implement the Approval and Continuing Approval Review processes for educator preparation programs in alignment with the Effective Preparation Framework, as presented.

- Develop a vetted list of third-party technical assistance and professional services providers who provide training and support to EPPs in alignment with the levers of the Effective Preparation Framework, as presented.
- Develop an updated process for awarding educator preparation programs the Innovative EPP Commendation in alignment with the levers of the Effective Preparation Framework, as presented.

### **DISCUSSION ONLY**

#### **15. Discussion of Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 230, Professional Educator Preparation and Certification, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter C, Assessment of Educators, Subchapter D, Types and Classes of Certificates Issued, and Subchapter G, Certificate Issuance Procedures**

Ms. Burkhart and Mr. Pitre presented this item to the Board. Mr. Pitre shared that the proposed updates in Chapter 230 includes Subchapter A, Subchapter C, Subchapter D, and Subchapter G. He explained the updates to Subchapters D and G.

Ms. Burkhart provided an update on the Texas-specific Teacher Performance Assessment (TPA) Development and the Request for Proposal (RFP) planning process. Ms. Burkhart provided a description of the stakeholder engagement and feedback regarding the exam parameters, including that the TPA be summative, performance-based, and centrally scored. Board members agreed with the recommendation that the assessment be content and grade-band specific. The Board requested that the assessment incorporate candidates' knowledge and skills in working with special populations and produce score reports that allow for sharing pertinent information with hiring districts post-certification.

Staff will continue to engage with stakeholders and provide updates to the Board throughout the development of Texas-specific Teacher Performance Assessment.

Public Testimony:

Dr. Jill Marshall – Self (Retired from UT Austin)

Dr. Elizabeth Ward – Texas Coalition for Educator Preparation

#### **16. Discussion of the Texas Educator Certification Examination Program Request for Proposal Process**

Ms. McLoughlin and Ms. Jenna Mattingly, TEA Director of Contracts and Purchasing, presented this item to the Board. Ms. McLoughlin explained that this discussion item is completely separate from the previous item in that it is a broader Request for Proposal (RFP) for the entirety of the certification exam program. She began by explaining that the Texas Educator Certification Examination Program (TECEP), includes the development and ongoing administration of all SBEC certification examinations as well as the scope and services provided under the TECEP.

Ms. Mattingly shared insight into the TEA competitive procurement processes focusing on planning, solicitation, and evaluation as well as the related legal and ethical considerations associated with the process.

Ms. McLoughlin provided additional context letting the Board know that TEA last entered a contract with the current vendor to administer the TECEP in 2018, and that as part of the normal cycle, it is time to put the contract back out for bid. She also shared a timeline of the current proposed exam priorities and launch dates as well as considerations regarding the proposed exam priorities.

Ms. McLoughlin invited Board members to share additional considerations or feedback regarding TECEP services, exam scope, or design priorities as staff moves forward to craft the components of the RFP.

Public Testimony:

Dr. Elizabeth Ward – Texas Coalition for Educator Preparation

Mr. Esdras Cantao – Simulados Software, Inc.

The SBEC recessed at 3:11 PM.

The SBEC reconvened at 3:21 PM.

**17. Discussion of Proposed Repeal of 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs, and New 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs**

Ms. Cook, Ms. Ayers, Ms. McLoughlin, and Ms. Yoder presented this item to the Board. Ms. Cook provided an overview of the comprehensive version of the 228 item including components of the Residency Certificate Pathway and the Effective Preparation Framework. She also highlighted the key components of the new Chapter 228 and reviewed the color-coding included in Attachment I, used to denote specific types of changes in the rule text.

Ms. Ayers shared an update with the board regarding the new additions since the April meeting. Ms. Yoder reviewed updates to the foundational components of the EPF reflecting stakeholder feedback including the use of performance tasks, practice-based preparation, integrated candidate supports and interventions, and the prioritization of co-teaching and invited any other considerations or missed opportunities to strengthen the focus areas.

Ms. Yoder led the board members in reflecting on the Teacher Residency Work Session noting what resonated with members and key takeaways. She also shared the proposed updates for the Teacher Residency route to certification including instructional setting, field supervisor requirements, certification exam requirements and evaluation of teacher candidate readiness. Ms. Yoder asked the board for feedback regarding the certification exam requirements for teacher residency candidates and parameters for candidates to demonstrate certificate readiness.

Ms. Cook closed out this item by sharing additional considerations for the September meeting including the implementation runways to allow time for EPPs to process updates,

conduct internal training, and develop curriculum in alignment with the changes in Chapter 228. She sought feedback from board members about the phased implementation dates for various sections of the Chapter 228 rules to ensure preparedness for all involved and reiterated that stakeholder feedback will continue to be gathered to inform recommendations.

Public Testimony:

Dr. Elizabeth Ward – Texas Coalition for Educator Preparation

Dr. Katie Tackett – The University of Texas at Austin

Dr. Allison Skerrett – The University of Texas at Austin

### **18. Discussion of Appointment of Teacher Pedagogy and English Language Arts and Reading and Math Content Pedagogy Educator Standards Advisory Committees**

Mr. Pitre and Ms. McLoughlin presented this item to the Board. Mr. Pitre began by providing background context regarding the legislative requirements that serve as the foundation for the discussion around the Teacher Pedagogy and English Language Arts (ELAR) and Math Content Pedagogy Standards. He shared the proposal for three separate educator standards committees dedicated to the teacher pedagogy standards, ELAR standards, and math standards. Mr. Pitre provided information about the committee member applications and associated timelines for development of the standards.

Ms. McLoughlin shared additional information regarding HB 1605, 88th Legislative Session, Regular Session, 2023, highlighting the broader set of changes and supports for the field around the implementation and use of High-Quality Instructional Materials (HQIM). She shared that there are a specific set of requirements that are related to educator preparation including: requiring the SBEC to develop training requirements for certification that include demonstration of thorough understanding of and competence in use of open education resource instructional materials included in the list of approved instructional materials maintained by the State Board of Education (SBOE) as well as requiring the SBEC to prohibit EPPs from providing instruction on the use of instructional materials that incorporate the method of three-cuing into foundational skills reading instruction.

Ms. McLoughlin closed out the item by proposing to return to the board in September with a deeper dive into HB 1605, providing background context around High-Quality Instructional Materials, Open Education Resources, and the SBOE approval process to engage more broadly about potential implications for candidates and EPPs including updates to the standards, certification exams, and program requirements.

### **INFORMATION ONLY**

### **19. Update of State Board for Educator Certification Enabling Legislation from the 87th Texas Legislature**

### **20. Board Operating Policies and Procedures (BOPP)**

### **21. 2023–2026 Rule Review Plan for State Board for Educator Certification Rules**

## 22. Adjournment

Chair Streepey adjourned the meeting at 4:47 PM.

## 23. Statutory Citations

The Board may go into closed session regarding any item on the agenda to the extent it is authorized to do so pursuant to the Texas Open Meetings Act, Texas Government Code, Chapter 551. The presiding officer of the Board intends to be physically present in Room 1-104, William B. Travis Building, 1701 North Congress Avenue. Some members may attend via videoconferencing.